Broken Mirrors: Public Higher Education and Racial Equity in the States

Kayla C. Elliott, Senior Policy Analyst for Higher Education
@kaylaCelliott

J. Oliver Schak, Senior Policy and Research Associate for Higher Education
@SchakJ
Overview

• Our Mission

• State Equity Report Card
  • Degree Attainment: Black and Latino Adults
  • Broken Mirrors: Black & Latino Representation at Public Colleges and Universities

• The Opportunity: Closing Degree Attainment Gaps
Our Mission

Through our research and advocacy, The Education Trust supports work that:

**Expands** excellence and equity in education, from preschool through college;

**Increases** college access and completion, particularly for historically underserved students; and

**Builds and engages** diverse communities that care about education equity, and increases political and public will to act on equity issues.
State Equity Report Card
Background

• The State Equity Report Card (SERC)
  • Grading/rating system that communicates states’ commitment to equitable college opportunity and success for people of color and individuals from low-income backgrounds

• The SERC project includes a data tool, several reports, and other collateral that focus on:
  • Degree Attainment (2018)
  • Undergraduate Enrollment Representation (Spring 2019)
  • Undergraduate Degree Earner Representation (Spring 2019)
  • College Affordability (2019)

“Broken Mirrors” (Black students) & “Broken Mirrors II” (Latino students)
Degree Attainment
What is Degree Attainment?

The share of adults, ages 25 to 64, that have some sort of college degree

Degree attainment is not a college graduation rate

Degree attainment looks at education level at a singular point in time
Why Focus on Attainment and Racial Equity?

Over 40 states with degree attainment goals

Achieving these goals will be unlikely without closing gaps in degree attainment

From 2000 to 2016

- Number of Latino adults grew 72%
- Number of Black adults grew 25%
- Number of White adults remained flat

47% of jobs will require a postsecondary degree (77 million jobs)

A college degree provides both individual and social benefits
31% of Black Adults and 47% of White Adults Have a College Degree or Higher

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey.
Gains in Degree Attainment for Black Adults Have Not Closed Gaps

**Figure 2**

PERCENTAGE POINT GAINS IN DEGREE ATTAINMENT FOR BLACK AND WHITE ADULTS SINCE 2000

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degree Level</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Associate</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor's</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau's 2016 American Community Survey and the 2000 Decennial Census.
23% of Latino Adults and 47% of White Adults Have a College Degree or Higher

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey.
Gains in Degree Attainment for Latino Adults Have Not Been Enough to Close Persistent Gaps

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau's 2016 American Community Survey and the 2000 Decennial Census.
Immigration Influences
Latino Degree Attainment

**FIGURE 9** DEGREE ATTAINMENT FOR LATINO ADULTS BY BIRTHPLACE, 2016

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey.

*Source for CA: 2017 ACS*
Latino Degree Attainment Varies by Ethnic Group

**Source for CA: 2017 ACS**
Broken Mirrors: Black & Latino Representation at Public Colleges and Universities
The students and graduates of public colleges and universities should mirror the demography of the state...
What did we do?

We asked 6 questions of public higher education in each state

• 3 questions focused on **enrollment representation**

• 3 questions focused on **degree earner representation**

Developed a metric to measure performance on each question
BLACK REPRESENTATION AT PUBLIC COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES
High-level Findings on Black Enrollment

Q1: In roughly half of the 41 states, Black enrollment at community and technical colleges fails to reflect the state’s racial composition of Black residents.

Q2: Black students are underrepresented at public four-year institutions in roughly 37 of the 41 states we examined.

Q3: Roughly three-quarters of states have considerable gaps in the enrollment of Black and White students at selective public four-year institutions.
High-level Findings on Black Degree Earners

Q4: Black graduates were underrepresented among associate degree earners in 33 of the 41 states we examined.

Q5: In 38 of 41 states the share of Black bachelor's degree earners was underrepresented compared to the state’s demographics.

Q6: Roughly half of 41 states have double-digit gaps between the shares of Black and White graduates who are awarded a bachelor’s degree.
LATINO REPRESENTATION AT PUBLIC COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES
High-level Findings on Latino Enrollment

Q1: Latino students are underrepresented at community and technical colleges in roughly 40 of the 44 states we examined.

Q2: Latino students are underrepresented at public four-year institutions in 33 out of 44 states in our analysis.

Q3: Over half of the states have gaps in the enrollment of Latino and White students at selective public four-year institutions.
High-level Findings on Latino Degree Earners

Q4: Latino residents are underrepresented among associate degree earners in all 44 states.

Q5: Latino residents are underrepresented among bachelor’s degree earners in all 44 states.

Q6: Latino graduates are less likely to receive a bachelor’s degree than their White peers in the majority of states.
Two-thirds of Latinos with no college degree live in just five states: California, Texas, Florida, New York, and Illinois.

**Enrollment Representation**

How well does Latino enrollment reflect the racial/ethnic composition of the state?

**Example: Metric 2: Public Four-Year Undergraduate Enrollment Representation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>% Latino undergrads</th>
<th>% Latino residents, ages 18-49, with HS diploma and no BA</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>34.9%</td>
<td>45.7%</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>34.7%</td>
<td>41.4%</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida</td>
<td>28.1%</td>
<td>28.4%</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>A+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>21.6%</td>
<td>22.6%</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>C-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Five key states need to improve on mirroring the state population among degree earners.

### Degree Earner Representation

How well does the race/ethnicity of undergraduate degree earners reflect the racial/ethnic composition of the state?

**Example: Metric 5: Bachelor’s Degree Earner Representation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>% Latino BA degree earners</th>
<th>% Latino residents, ages 18-49, with HS diploma and no BA</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>29.1%</td>
<td>45.7%</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>29.9%</td>
<td>41.4%</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>C-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida</td>
<td>24.9%</td>
<td>28.4%</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>B+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
<td>22.6%</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>C-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
State Equity Report Card: Entry Page

Data and grades available at stateequity.org

The State Equity Report Card

The State Equity Report Card assesses states' commitment to equitable college opportunity and success for Black and Latino Americans. This tool contains state-level data on who has a college degree, who enrolls in college, and who graduates.

Ready to Get Started?

FIND MY STATE  COMPARE STATES
The Opportunity: Closing Degree Attainment Gaps
State Attainment Goals – Best Practices

- Set specific, separate attainment goals for racial subgroups
- Use current attainment levels of the relevant subgroups as a baseline
- Aim to increase the rates of attainment among underrepresented groups more rapidly than the overall population.
- Establish interim benchmarks for subgroups, track progress over time, and hold institutions, educators, and policymakers accountable
- Identify and pursue strategies aimed specifically at closing racial attainment gaps
Several states have identified race-conscious strategies to close gaps for students of color. Here are the initiatives:

### Target Students and Faculty of Color

- **KY**: Academic Leadership Development Institute for early career faculty of color
- **MN**: Equity in Education and Job Connection Grants
- **MO**: Efforts to recruit and retain diverse faculty
- **OK**: Outreach to immigrant students, connection to ESL services
- **TX**: Supporting grants for Minority Male Initiatives

### Prioritize Equity in Planning and Policy Development

- **KY**: Statewide diversity policy, campus diversity plans with targets on select goals and annual progress tracking
- **MN**: OHE Equity Institute
- **NV**: Diversity Summits; Chancellor’s Diversity Roundtable; Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Council
- **OR**: Equity Lens

### Target Institutions Serving Students of Color

- **MD**: Support HBCUs, Foster Collaboration Between HBCUs and PWIs
- **NV**: HSI Task Force
Minnesota Sets Specific Racial Equity Goals

Increase Needed of Minnesotans Age 25-44 with Postsecondary Certificates or Degrees to Attain 70% Goal by 2025, Basic Race/Ethnicity Groups, 2011-2015

AMERICAN INDIAN: 6,500
MULTIRACIAL: 3,400
HISPANIC: 36,300
ASIAN: 4,700
BLACK: 33,500
WHITE: 46,700
ALL: 131,400

Current certificate or degree holders
Additional certificate or degree holders needed to meet 70% goal (labeled)

Source: IPUMS microdata version of U.S. Census Bureau 2011-2015 American Community Survey, with tabulations and additional analysis by the Minnesota Demographic Center.
Texas Sets Interim Benchmarks for Racial Equity Goals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goal and Interim Benchmarks</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2025</th>
<th>2030</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase the number of students completing a certificate, associate, bachelor’s, or master’s from an institution of higher education in Texas to at least…</td>
<td>376,000</td>
<td>455,000</td>
<td>550,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first four targets are directly related to the completion goal. To reach this goal, Texas will need to maintain the strong degree production increases that it has experienced in recent years. (298,989 as of 2014)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Targets to Reach the Goal</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2025</th>
<th>2030</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase the number of Hispanic students completing a certificate or degree to at least…</td>
<td>138,000</td>
<td>198,000</td>
<td>285,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This target and the next one will help increase parity across completers for groups that have traditionally been underrepresented. (Hispanics 89,355 as of 2014; African Americans 37,658 as of 2014)

| Increase the number of African American students completing a certificate or degree to at least… | 48,000 | 59,000 | 76,000 |
| Increase the number of male students completing a certificate or degree to at least… | 168,000 | 215,000 | 275,000 |

The percentage of women enrolled in and graduating from higher education institutions has grown and men are not keeping pace. This target provides a means to monitor progress toward gender parity. (122,744 as of 2014)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The How - Strategies for Embedding Equity in State Attainment Goals &amp; Postsecondary Plans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From the USC Center for Urban Education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Know your state. | • Conduct a rigorous analysis of economic and demographic contexts. |
| Create goals. | • Create attainment goals that are clear, ambitious, and reflect equity priorities. |
| Build a careful process. | • Start the equity conversation by establishing a deliberate, inclusive process of plan development. |
| Craft a strong message. | • Develop a clear “story” about the equity imperative in your state. |
| Know what works. | • Identify policy assets and levers that can reinforce equity-focused attainment goals. |
| Make the plan a living document. | • Monitor and report publicly on progress and update goals regularly. |

Thank You!

J. Oliver Schak
Senior Policy and Research Associate for Higher Education
OSchak@edtrust.org // @Schakj

Kayla C. Elliott
Senior Policy Analyst for Higher Education
KElliot@edtrust.org // @kaylaCelliott