Equity in Encouraging and Enforcing Mitigation Measures

September 17, 2020
Kalyn Hill
Senior Policy Analyst
Public Safety & Legal Counsel
Center for Best Practices
Khill@nga.org
Housekeeping

• If you experience technical difficulties, please contact Carl Amritt via the chat or at camritt@nga.org.

Unmute yourself to ask a question. OR Send a private chat to NGA staff, panelists, group members or the entire audience.
I. Welcome and Introductions

II. Stephan K. Bayens, Commissioner, Iowa Department of Public Safety

III. Leo Beletsky, Professor of Law and Health Sciences and Faculty Director, Health in Justice Action Lab, Northwestern University

IV. Maya Hazarika Watts, Senior Attorney, ChangeLab Solutions

V. Question & Answer
Stephan K. Bayens
Commissioner
Iowa Department of Public Safety
CONTINUITY AND EQUITY IN IOWA’S COVID-19 RESPONSE
Stephan K. Bayens was appointed Commissioner of the Iowa Department of Public Safety by Governor Kim Reynolds on January 14, 2019. Prior thereto, Commissioner Bayens was as an Assistant United States Attorney for the Southern District of Iowa, where he served as the coordinator for the Department of Justice’s Project Safe Neighborhood initiative.

For 15 years, Commissioner Bayens was an Assistant Polk County Attorney in Des Moines, Iowa, where he specialized in drug and gang prosecutions and asset forfeiture. Prior to that he was an Assistant Attorney General assigned to the Special Litigation Division of the Iowa Attorney General's Office and was an Attorney Clerk for the Iowa Court of Appeals.

Commissioner Bayens is a 1996 graduate of Central College in Pella, Iowa and a 1999 high honors graduate of Drake University Law School in Des Moines, Iowa.
PREPARATION FOR PUBLIC HEALTH PROCLAMATIONS

- Enforcement Authority
  - Criminal vs. Administrative Enforcement
  - Obligations of law enforcement
  - Memorandum from Iowa Attorney General’s Office outlining statutory obligations of all peace officers to carry out lawful orders of the Governor and the Department of Public Health
  - Iowa Department of Public Safety agreed to serve as the primary point of contact for criminal enforcement for local law enforcement agencies and prosecutors
  - Administrative enforcement through the Alcoholic Beverages Division and the Department of Inspections and Appeals
COMUNICATION PLANNING

• Establishing Points of Contact
  • Consistent communication between Governor's staff, Department of Public Health, and Department of Public Safety
    • Discussion of contemplated executive actions and their implications
    • Clarity regarding intent of proclamation
  • Need for some element of forewarning or delayed implementation
    • Law enforcement staffing issues
    • Community engagement
    • Responsiveness to questions or concerns
April 7, 2020

Dear Law Enforcement Partners:

As you are aware, Iowans are facing an unprecedented public health disaster emergency as we seek to reduce the transmission of COVID-19 in our state.

I have taken numerous executive actions to protect the health of Iowans since first declaring a disaster emergency on March 9, 2020. I have prohibited all social, community, spiritual, religious, recreational, leisure, and sporting gatherings of more than 10 people. I have closed dine-in restaurants and bars, social clubs, theaters, malls, and casinos, playgrounds and other places where congregating people may increase the spread of the virus. And I have closed many other non-essential retail establishments, salons, barbershops, and other places where public interaction unnecessarily increases the risk of transmission.

I know that most Iowans want to do the right thing to help protect our community and the most vulnerable among us. But we need your assistance in helping to educate Iowans about these orders, encourage compliance, and if necessary, enforce these orders. In my most recent proclamation ordering additional closures and mitigation efforts, I renewed my call for all peace officers of the state to assist in the enforcement of these orders under sections 29C.18 and 135.33 of the Iowa Code. I have every confidence law enforcement will use good judgment in the exercise of their duties and will consider legal intervention only if truly necessary.

If you have any questions about these orders, do not hesitate to contact Department of Public Safety Commissioner Stephan Bayens at (515) 725-6180.

On behalf of all Iowans, thank you for all that you are doing to protect and serve your communities. You stand on the front lines of this effort to curb the spread of COVID-19.

Sincerely yours,

Kim Reynolds
Governor of Iowa
COMMUNICATION PLANNING

- Law Enforcement Points of Contact
  - 392 law enforcement agencies in Iowa
    - Already strong relationships
    - Utilized local law enforcement associations to facilitate communication
      - Iowa Sheriffs and Deputies Association
      - Iowa Police Chiefs Association
      - Iowa County Attorney’s Association
  - Established centralized points of contact within DPS capable of responding to questions or concerns from local law enforcement
  - Accessible line of communication back to Governor’s staff for discussion of reoccurring questions or needed points of clarity
COMMUNICATION PLANNING

• Bi-monthly meetings with state law enforcement agencies around the Midwest
  • Sought input on effectiveness of proclamations in their states
  • Troubleshoot common problems
    • Differing ideological viewpoints oftentimes lead to differing responses between states
    • Created some tension among border communities
  • Shared differences from state to state
    • Rumors of closed borders
    • Closure of businesses in one state could have a substantial impact on border cities in a contiguous state
• **Consistency of Messaging**

  • Iowa’s Governor issued 24 public health proclamations between March and September of 2020.
  
  • The Department of Public Safety received an advanced copy of all proclamations.
  
  • In-house legal counsel reviewed each proclamation for law enforcement applicability and prepared a practical application memo that was distributed throughout the state.
  
  • Dissemination brought forth regional concerns that was shared with the Governor’s Office.
  
  • Memo incorporated:
    - Examples
    - Intent and context behind each proclamation
    - Applicable sunset dates
STATE FIRE MARSHAL GUIDANCE FOR DETERMINING OCCUPANT CAPACITY

On May 1, 2020, Governor Reynolds lifted restrictions for certain businesses and establishments in 77 Iowa counties. Businesses allowed to serve the public must reduce their capacity as outlined in the proclamation. The following guidance can be used to help estimate the permitted occupant capacity for certain businesses under the Governor’s supplemental proclamation dated April 27, 2020. An official occupant load number should be obtained from a licensed architect, as there can be additional factors to consider to ensure the occupant capacity is accurate.

ESTIMATED OCCUPANCY CALCULATION

Sample Retail Calculation:
2,000 SQ. FT. ÷ 100 (occupant load) = 20
20 ÷ 2 = 10 persons

A non-restaurant business can estimate capacity by dividing the establishment’s square footage by the occupant load factor (see table at right). In the above estimate calculation, a 2,000 square foot retail store would normally have a capacity of 20 persons. Under the Governor’s proclamation, the capacity must be reduced by 50%, which equals 10 persons.

For estimating purposes, any establishment with only one exit is limited to a capacity of 49 persons or less. Establishments with a capacity of over 49 people must have at least two exits. Exits can only be counted if they serve the general public area and are marked as exits.

As a result, any business greater than 5,000 square feet with a single exit is limited to a capacity of 49 people. Under the Governor’s proclamation, that capacity must be reduced by 50%, which equals 24 persons.

BUSINESS OR ESTABLISHMENT | OCCUPANT LOAD FACTOR
--- | ---
RESTAURANTS | N/A – See Department of Inspections and Appeals Restaurant TAG question #12
FITNESS CENTERS | 50
LIBRARIES | 50
Reading Rooms | 100
Common Book Areas | 100
RETAIL ESTABLISHMENTS | 100
State Public Health Emergency Declaration Provides Temporary Extension of Weapon Permits

Debbie McClung
Strategic Communications Bureau Chief
March 21, 2020

DES MOINES, Iowa - On March 20, 2020, Governor Reynolds issued an additional State Public Health Emergency Declaration related to the COVID-19 virus. Included in the proclamation were certain modifications to the current law on weapon permits.

The declaration temporarily addresses portions of Iowa law regarding professional and nonprofessional permits to carry firearms, and permits to acquire pistols or revolvers. Based on the Governor’s actions, permits to carry weapons and permits to acquire will not expire during the declaration. This extension, however, does not allow one to use an otherwise expired permit to purchase a firearm without completion of a NICS (National Instant Criminal Background Check System) check at the time of the purchase or transfer. All Federal Firearms License holders (FFLS) must conduct a NICS check prior to the sale or transfer of any firearm if an expired permit is presented. Again, a holder of an otherwise expired permit will not be able to purchase a firearm without a NICS being performed by the FFL.

The declaration also gives county sheriffs greater discretion in determining how they receive weapon permit applications so as to limit the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Please check with your local county sheriff’s department to determine its procedure for accepting applications during this time.
MESSAGING THE 3 E’S

- Education, Encouragement, Enforcement
  - Clear direction from the top down that enforcement should be considered a last resort
  - Initial complaint:
    - Law enforcement should attempt to educate on the need for good public health measures and the current state of the proclamation
  - Second complaint:
    - Strongly encourage compliance to include an explanation of the legal ramifications should non-compliance continue
  - Third complaint:
    - Criminal or administrative enforcement
MESSAGING THE 3 E’S

• Governor held daily press conferences that were carried on every local network in the state
  • A portion of each press conference focused on different areas of the state’s response to include law enforcement responsibilities
  • During those portions related to law enforcement, personal responsibility was the primary theme so as to conserve resources
  • The gradual progression of education, encouragement, and enforcement was shared with the public
  • Shared that no member of law enforcement has any desire to make an arrest or issue a citation
  • Simulcast in other languages and sign language interpreter
LAW ENFORCEMENT CHALLENGES

• Criminal Enforcement
  • Citation vs. Arrest
  • Who to cite?
    • Manager/Owner vs. Server/Bartender
• Administrative Enforcement
  • Alignment with state regulatory agencies
  • Ability to place local law enforcement in touch with administrative points of contact
• Mitigate Public Safety Tension
  • Stringent enforcement of public health proclamations vs. efforts by corrections or local jails to minimize admittance
LAW ENFORCEMENT CHALLENGES

• Differing viewpoints throughout law enforcement
  • Personal responsibility vs. State imposed health measures
• Pressures of being an elected official in law enforcement
  • Sheriffs are elected officials
  • Their constituency may differ in ideology or philosophy than the state’s plan of action
• Flood of complaints
  • Some legitimate, some directed at competition, some just generally angry with state and local response
  • Given the volume of complaints, consistent messaging was key
  • Complaints that certain business types were targeted by the public health proclamations
LAW ENFORCEMENT CHALLENGES

• Seeking common ground between local emergency managers, public health officials, and law enforcement
  • Often had differing views within their county or municipality
  • The Department of Public Safety attempted to mediate those disagreements to mitigate the public health risks and jointly addressed issues with local officials
• Efforts to avoid a patchwork of local ordinances
  • State Attorney General rendered a legal opinion about the validity of such orders and local law enforcement’s ability to enforce them
  • Most local ordinances passed failed to contain an enforcement mechanism
RURAL / URBAN DIVIDE

• Iowa is not overly diverse regarding race and ethnicity but the rural / urban divide is significant.
• Outbreaks and significant community spread were most pronounced in urban centers.
• Many rural areas were relatively untouched.
• Iowa is uniquely comprised of 99 counties.
  • 16 counties account for approximately 70% of the positive cases.
• The remaining counties had relatively few cases and those that did were somewhat isolated to the agricultural and meatpacking industries.
• Early health proclamations had statewide effect
• Many rural communities are struggling to remain viable and are heavily reliant on small businesses
• As a result, there was some pushback from those rural counties that had little to no community spread
• It was more difficult to seek enforcement continuity in those counties given those dynamics
• Subsequent health proclamations were more narrowly tailored to only those counties were positivity rates were high
• Generated fairness and equity claims but the messaging was consistent that the use of the state’s powers was being narrowly drawn
• Iowa has a number of Amish and Mennonite communities

• Those communities tend to be extremely communal both internally and with similar communities in other states

• Questions began to arise about barn raisings and auctions that were central to their way of life

• Many of these events draw attendance from communities as far away as Pennsylvania

• Law enforcement had no desire to issue citations or arrest members of the community and the community at times found the central tenants of their faith conflicted with a number of the proclamations
CULTURAL IMPACTS

• Law enforcement was very intentional and engaged with those communities to find solutions that were satisfactory to all involved

• Auctions were permitted to occur but participants had to remain in their buggies

• Some of the social aspects inherent in these activities were curtailed or steps were made to ensure good public health measures were followed

• Communication with the Governor's Office was key so subtle clarifications could be made to proclamations

• Early proclamations mentioned events may continue if attendees remained in their motor vehicle but did not mention buggies
LEGISLATIVE UPDATE
QUESTIONS
Leo Beletsky

Professor of Law and Health Sciences and Faculty Director, Health in Justice Action Lab

Northwestern University
The Overdose Crisis

Three phases
1. Prescription drugs
2. Heroin
3. Illicitly-manufactured fentanyl

Source: New York Times (2017), National Center for Health Statistics, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
“Public Health” Approach
Operationalization: DIH Statutes

DIH Law Proliferation 2009-2019

Source: www.pdaps.org
EXCLUSIVE: U.S. Attorney Preet Bharara to slap opioid dealers linked to fatal overdoses with federal charges

United States Attorney Announces Charges Against Narcotics Trafficker Connected To Heroin Overdose Death

Preet Bharara, the United States Attorney for the Southern District of New York, William F. Sweeney Jr., Assistant Director in Charge of the New York Field Office of the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), and other law enforcement officials announced charges against Anthony Delosangeles alleging that he unlawfully distributed and sold heroin, and caused the death of Thomas Cippollaro, a 25-year-old White Plains man.

U.S. Attorney Preet Bharara stated: “The epidemic of opioid abuse is devastating our communities. Charges like those announced today strike at the heart of the problem — dealers who fuel the cycle of addiction and overdose. Anthony Delosangeles allegedly dealt in heroin, including the heroin that killed Thomas Cippollaro, a 25-year-old White Plains man. We thank the FBI and our local law enforcement partners for their extraordinary efforts that led to the charges today.”
Surge of DIH Charges Overtime

DIH Charges by Year (1974-2017)

Total Cases: 2534

Source: http://healthinjustice.org/drug-induced-homicide
Enforcement Discretion Tells a Racist Tale

RACE OF ACCUSED (DEALER) AND VICTIM (BUYER)

Near majority of cases involving alleged dealers represent a person of color “dealer”- white “victim” dyad, confirming that this trend is squarely rooted in the racist implementation of drug laws

RACE OF ACCUSED (DEALER) & VICTIM (BUYER)

- White Accused & White Victim
- P.O.C Accused & White Victim

(N = 611)

P.O.C Defined as Person of Color. Source: Online News Articles 2000-2017

Health in Justice (2017)
Mapping onto Drug War Disparities

MEDIAN SENTENCING BY ACCUSED RACE

*Data Based on Automated Analysis of Online News Sources

Source: http://healthinjustice.org/drug-induced-homicide
“If you[‘re] the one that's with them when they go out, you're possibly going to be CHARGED WITH THEIR DEATH. So that's the main reason why a lot of people don't call [911].”

Source: Latimore and Bergstein, IJDP (2017)
COVID-19 Enforcement

“A Tale of Two Cities”

Source: Twitter.com (2020)
COVID-19 Enforcement

Seven arrested for violating stay-at-home order on Saturday

Source: TheBlate.com (2020)
COVID-19 Enforcement: Social Listening Data

Violation Type

- Null
- curfew
- exposure as biological weapon
- face mask
- gatherings
- quarantine
- social distancing
- stay-at-home
- travel advisory

Source: healthinjustice.org (2020)
COVID-19 Enforcement: Time Trends

Source: healthinjustice.org (2020)
COVID-19 Enforcement: Social Listening Data

Race of Individuals

- White: 37.55%
- Black: 36.96%
- Middle Eastern/North African: 20.75%
- Latinx: 2.57%
- Indigenous/Native: 0.20%
- Pacific Islander: 0.20%

Source: healthinjustice.org (2020)
COVID-19 Enforcement: Impact on Help-Seeking

11 Students Have Been Suspended From Northeastern Without A Tuition Refund For Violating COVID-19 Policies

The students, who paid an estimated $36,543 in tuition for the semester, were given 24 hours to leave their dorms.

Ade Onibada
BuzzFeed News Reporter

Posted on September 5, 2020, at 3:02 p.m. ET

Effective Public Health Response Depends on
- Contact Tracing
- Testing
- Isolation and quarantine
- Treatment
COVID-19 Risk is High for Law Enforcement

“Sixty-five law enforcement officers have died in the line of duty so far this year, but coronavirus deaths could push that number up to as many as 118, according to the National Law Enforcement Memorial and Museum.” – Boston Herald

Officer Jose V. Fernandez, Boston Police Department, 29-year veteran
Implications

1. Policy theater vs. real policy impact
2. Analyzing deterrence effect: prevention vs. help-seeking
3. Stay true to the maxims:
   - Least restrictive means necessary
   - Narrowly tailored
4. Context: conversations about the role of police, other carceral systems in society
Thank you

L.beletsky@neu.edu
@leobeletsky
www.HealthInJustice.org
www.changingthenarrative.news
Maya Hazarika Watts
Senior Attorney
ChangeLab Solutions
Equitable Enforcement of Public Health Laws

https://www.changelabsolutions.org/good-governance
Our Mission

ChangeLab Solutions is a national organization whose mission is to create healthier communities for all through equitable laws and policies. Our multidisciplinary team of public health lawyers, policy analysts, planners, and other professionals works with state, tribal, local, and territorial health departments, other governments agencies, public health organizations, and anchor institutions to create thriving communities.
The Fundamental Drivers of Health Inequity

- Structural discrimination
- Income inequality and poverty
- Disparities in opportunity
- Disparities in political power
- Governance that limits meaningful participation
What is equitable enforcement?

the process of ensuring compliance with law and policy that considers and minimizes harms to underserved communities
Underenforcement

When laws that are designed to protect communities from threats to health and economic security are not consistently enforced
Overenforcement

When laws designed to protect the health of the public are disproportionately enforced in marginalized communities – such as those where residents are disproportionately of color, or where most residents earn low wages.
Aspects of Enforcement

- Who can enforce?
- Targets for enforcement
- Role of victims and communities
- Investigative and adjudicatory processes
- Range of sanctions
Traditional Mechanisms of Enforcement of Public Health Laws

- Administrative Enforcement
  - Fines and licensing
- Civil Enforcement
  - Fines, injunctions, and evictions
- Criminal Enforcement
  - Fines and imprisonment
Equitable Enforcement Guide

https://www.changelabsolutions.org/product/equitable-enforcement-achieve-health-equity
Considerations for Policy Design and Implementation
Policy Design

- Graduated Enforcement
- Range of Sanctions
- Use of Non-Punitive Enforcement Measures
Policy Design

• Proactive or Complaint Based Enforcement

• Community Involvement in Design and Evaluation

• Data Collection and Ongoing Evaluation
• Adequate funding for enforcement

• Ongoing training for enforcement officers

• Policy updates based on ongoing evaluation
Implementation

• Careful and Intentional Designation of Enforcement Bodies
• Role of Community and Victims in Enforcement
• Guardrails for Discretion
Thank you!

Web: www.changelabsolutions.org

Twitter: @ChangeLabWorks

Facebook: @ChangeLabSolutions

Contact us: https://www.changelabsolutions.org/form/contact-us
Questions?
Upcoming Webinars

**Webinar #2: Equitable Distribution and Uptake of Remedies and Resources**
Thursday, October 22, 2020 | 2:00 – 3:30 PM EDT

**Webinar #3: People Experiencing Homelessness**
Thursday, November 19, 2020 | 2:00 – 3:30 PM EDT

**Webinar #4: People Who Are Incarcerated**
Thursday, December 17, 2020 | 2:00 – 3:30 PM EDT